

VU Research Portal

Latent defect or excessive price?

de Bruijn, C.J.

2018

document version

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

citation for published version (APA)

de Bruijn, C. J. (2018). *Latent defect or excessive price? Exploring early modern legal approach to remedying defects in goods exchanged for money*. [PhD-Thesis - Research and graduation internal, Vrije Universiteit Amsterdam].

General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

E-mail address:

vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl

Table of contents

Acknowledgements	xiv
Abbreviations	xvii
1 Subject and methodology	3
1.1 Introduction	3
1.1.1 Subject matter of this study	3
1.1.2 Aims of this study	6
1.1.3 Why study the law about defects in things exchanged for money?	7
1.1.4 Current state of research	8
1.2 Methodology	10
1.2.1 Comparative legal history	10
1.2.2 Research topics	11
1.2.3 Selection of sources and literature	15
1.3 Structure	18
2 Medieval <i>ius commune</i> on the remedies for defects in a thing exchanged for money	21
2.1 Introduction	21
2.2 Medieval <i>ius commune</i> on the law of latent defects	23
2.2.1 The aedilician remedies: redundant rules?	23
2.2.1.1 Scope of the civil and aedilician remedies	23
2.2.1.2 Assessment of price reduction	26
2.2.1.3 Limitation periods	28
2.2.1.4 Favourable characteristics of the aedilician remedies	31
2.2.2 Extension to lease	33
2.2.3 Increased liability	34
2.2.4 Liability for encumbrances on immovables	37
2.3 Lesion beyond moiety (<i>laesio enormis</i>)	44
2.3.1 The remedy for lesion beyond moiety as the preferred remedy for breach of contract	48
2.3.2 Lesion beyond moiety - outlook	52
2.3.2.1 Presumption of fraud	52
2.3.2.2 Limitation periods	55
2.3.2.3 Assessment of the just price	55
2.3.2.4 Extension to lease and movables	56
2.4 Remedies for latent defects vs the remedy for lesion beyond moiety	58
2.5 Summary and concluding remarks	61
3 Early modern Castilian law on the remedies for defects in the thing exchanged for money	69
3.1 Introduction	69
3.2 The legal context of early modern Castile	73
3.2.1 Legal sources	73
3.2.1.1 Case law from the Royal Chancery of Valladolid	74
3.2.2 Scholastic foundations of a natural law theory on remedies for defects in the thing sold	78

TABLE OF CONTENTS

3.2.2.1 The formulation of general rules	80
3.2.2.2 Fairness in exchange	82
3.2.2.3 A just price	85
3.2.2.4 Deviation from the just price as breach of fairness in exchange	87
3.2.2.5 Fairness in exchange and the sale of a defective thing	91
3.3 Castilian legal doctrine and practice on the law of latent defects	94
3.3.1 The aedilician remedies: redundant rules?	94
3.3.1.1 Scope of the civil and aedilician remedies	94
3.3.1.1.1 Legal practice	97
3.3.1.2 Assessment of price reduction	98
3.3.1.2.1 Legal practice	100
3.3.1.3 Limitation periods	101
3.3.1.3.1 Legal practice	104
3.3.1.4 Favourable characteristics of the aedilician remedies	105
3.3.1.4.1 Legal practice	106
3.3.2 Extension to lease	106
3.3.2.1 Legal practice	107
3.3.3 Increased liability	107
3.3.3.1 Legal practice	112
3.3.4 Liability for encumbrances on immovables	113
3.3.4.1 Legal practice	117
3.4 Lesion beyond moiety (<i>laesio enormis</i>)	121
3.4.1 Presumption of fraud	121
3.4.1.1 Legal practice	125
3.4.2 Limitation periods	126
3.4.2.1 Legal practice	128
3.4.3 Assessment of the just price	129
3.4.3.1 Legal practice	130
3.4.4 Extension to buyers, movables, and lease	132
3.4.4.1 Legal practice	134
3.5 Remedies for latent defects vs the remedy for lesion beyond moiety	135
3.6 Summary and concluding remarks	140
4 Legal humanism on the remedies for defects in a thing exchanged for money	150
4.1 Introduction	150
4.2 Humanist legal doctrine on the law of latent defects	152
4.2.1 The aedilician remedies: redundant rules?	152
4.2.1.1 Scope of the civil and aedilician remedies	152
4.2.1.2 Assessment of price reduction	157
4.2.1.2.1 Excurs: a case before the <i>Reichskammergericht</i>	162
4.2.1.3 Limitation periods	165
4.2.1.4 Favourable characteristics of the aedilician remedies	171
4.2.2 Extension to lease	172
4.2.3 Increased liability	178
4.2.4 Liability for encumbrances on immovables	185
4.3 Lesion beyond moiety (<i>laesio enormis</i>)	190
4.3.1 Presumption of fraud	191
4.3.2 Limitation periods	193

TABLE OF CONTENTS

4.3.3 Just price	195
4.3.4 Extension to buyers, movables, and lease	196
4.4 Remedies for latent defects vs the remedy for lesion beyond moiety	200
4.5 Summary and concluding remarks	202
5 Early modern Dutch law on the remedies for defects in a thing exchanged for money	210
5.1 Introduction	210
5.1.1 Legal practice - sources	211
5.1.2 Procedural law	213
5.2 Early modern Dutch legal doctrine and practice on the law of latent defects	217
5.2.1 The aedilician remedies: redundant rules?	217
5.2.1.1 Scope of the civil and aedilician remedies	217
5.2.1.2 Assessment of price reduction	220
5.2.1.2.1 Legal practice	224
5.2.1.3 Limitation periods	226
5.2.1.3.1 Roman-Frisian legal doctrine on limitation	229
5.2.1.3.2 Roman-Dutch legal practice on limitation	232
5.2.1.4 Favourable characteristics of the aedilician remedies	234
5.2.2 Extension to lease	239
5.2.2.1 Roman-Frisian legal doctrine on extension to lease	242
5.2.2.2 Legal practice	244
5.2.3 Increased liability	245
5.2.3.1 Roman-Frisian legal doctrine on increased liability	247
5.2.4 Liability for encumbrances on immovables	250
5.2.4.1 Roman-Dutch legal practice	256
5.2.4.2 Roman-Frisian legal practice	257
5.3 Lesion beyond moiety (<i>laesio enormis</i>)	260
5.3.1 Presumption of fraud	262
5.3.2 Limitation periods	264
5.3.2.1 Legal practice	265
5.3.3 Assessment of the just price	266
5.3.3.1 Legal practice	266
5.3.4 Extension to buyers, movables and lease	267
5.3.4.1 Legal practice	269
5.4 Remedies for latent defects vs the remedy for lesion beyond moiety	270
5.5 Summary and concluding remarks	272
6 Seventeenth and eighteenth century natural law on the remedies for defects in a thing exchanged for money	280
6.1 Introduction	280
6.1.1 Natural law: a changing paradigm	281
6.2 Seventeenth and eighteenth century natural law on the law of latent defects	286
6.2.1 The aedilician remedies: redundant rules?	286
6.2.1.1 Scope of the civil and aedilician remedies	286
6.2.1.2 Natural law theory and positive law: a difficult union	289
6.2.1.3 Assessment of price reduction	292
6.2.1.4 Limitation periods	297

TABLE OF CONTENTS

6.2.1.5 Favourable characteristics of the aedilician remedies	301
6.2.2 Extension to lease	305
6.2.3 Increased liability	309
6.2.4 Liability for encumbrances on immovables	313
6.3 The end of <i>laesio enormis</i> ?	317
6.3.1 How to restore a breach of fairness in exchange?	318
6.3.2 Doctrinal arguments against fairness in exchange	321
6.4 Remedies for latent defects vs the remedy for lesion beyond moiety	328
6.5 Summary and concluding remarks	330
7 Codes of civil law on the remedies for defects in a thing exchanged for money	338
7.1 Introduction	338
7.2 The <i>Allgemeine Landrecht für die Preußischen Staaten</i> (1794)	342
7.2.1 The law of latent defects in 18 th century Prussia	342
7.2.2 Towards a Prussian civil code	344
7.2.2.1 Structure of the <i>Allgemeine Landrecht für die preußischen Staaten</i>	345
7.2.2.2 <i>Gewährleistung</i> in the <i>Allgemeine Landrecht für die preußischen Staaten</i>	345
7.2.3 Limitation periods	348
7.2.4 Lesion beyond moiety (<i>Laesio enormis</i>)	351
7.2.4.1 Presumption of fraud	353
7.2.4.2 Limitation periods	355
7.2.4.3 Just price	356
7.2.4.4 Extension to lease	357
7.3 The <i>Code civil</i> (1804)	358
7.3.1 Structure of the <i>Code civil</i>	358
7.3.2 The <i>Code civil</i> on latent defects	359
7.3.2.1 <i>La garantie</i> in the <i>Code civil</i>	359
7.3.3 Limitation periods	360
7.3.4 Lesion beyond moiety (<i>laesio enormis</i>)	362
7.3.4.1 Presumption of fraud	365
7.3.4.2 Limitation periods	365
7.3.4.3 Just price	366
7.3.4.4 Extension to lease	368
7.4 The <i>Österreichische Allgemeine Bürgerliche Gesetzbuch</i> (1811)	369
7.4.1 Structure of the <i>Allgemeine Bürgerliche Gesetzbuch</i>	369
7.4.2 The <i>Allgemeine Bürgerliche Gesetzbuch</i> on latent defects	370
7.4.2.1 <i>Gewährleistung</i> in the <i>Allgemeine Bürgerliche Gesetzbuch</i>	370
7.4.3 Limitation periods	372
7.4.4 Lesion beyond moiety (<i>laesio enormis</i>)	373
7.4.4.1 Presumption of fraud	374
7.4.4.2 Limitation periods	375
7.4.4.3 Just price	375
7.4.4.4 Extension to lease	375
7.5 The Dutch <i>Burgerlijk wetboek</i> 1838	376
7.5.1 Structure of the <i>Burgerlijk wetboek</i> 1838	377

TABLE OF CONTENTS

7.5.2 The <i>Burgerlijk wetboek</i> 1838 on latent defects	378
7.5.2.1 <i>Vrijwaring</i> of latent defects in the <i>Burgerlijk wetboek</i> 1838	378
7.5.3 Limitation periods	378
7.5.4 Lesion beyond moiety (<i>laesio enormis</i>)	379
7.6 The <i>Código civil Español</i> (1889)	382
7.6.1 Structure of the <i>Código civil</i>	382
7.6.2 The <i>Código civil</i> on latent defects	383
7.6.2.1 <i>Saneamiento</i> in the <i>Código civil</i>	383
7.6.3 Limitation periods	384
7.6.4 Lesion beyond moiety (<i>laesio enormis</i>)	385
7.7 The <i>Bürgerliche Gesetzbuch</i> (1900)	388
7.7.1 Structure of the <i>Bürgerliche Gesetzbuch</i>	389
7.7.2 The <i>Bürgerliche Gesetzbuch</i> on latent defects	390
7.7.2.1 <i>Gewährleistung</i> in the <i>Bürgerliche Gesetzbuch</i>	390
7.7.3 Limitation periods	391
7.7.4 Lesion beyond moiety (<i>laesio enormis</i>)	392
7.8 Summary and concluding remarks	396
8 Contemporary civil law	403
8.1 Introduction	403
8.2 The new Dutch <i>Burgerlijk wetboek</i> (NBW)	405
8.2.1 Limitation	408
8.3 The German <i>Schuldrechtsmodernisierung</i> of 2002	412
8.3.1 Limitation	413
8.4 The French <i>Réforme de la prescription</i> of 2008	418
8.4.1 Limitation	419
8.5 The Spanish <i>Propuesta para la modernización del Derecho de obligaciones y contratos</i> of 2009	422
8.5.1 Limitation	424
8.6 The Austrian <i>Allgemeine Bürgerliche Gesetzbuch</i> of 1811	429
8.6.1 The ABGB in comparison	432
8.7 The Proposal for a Common European Sales Law of 2011	434
8.8 Summary and concluding remarks	437
9 Summary and concluding remarks	442
9.1 For the last time: B's remedies	442
9.2 Summary	445
9.2.1 Research topics	446
9.2.2 Findings	447
9.3 Concluding remarks	460
Appendix A. Overview of <i>pleitos</i> and <i>ejecutorias</i> brought before the Royal Chancery of Valladolid	467
Appendix B. Scans of manuscript files of <i>pleitos</i> brought before the Royal Chancery of Valladolid	471
Bibliography	516
Index of cases	538

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Index of sources	543
------------------	-----